

July 25, 2018

Proposal Evaluation Summary
Tire Services – RFP #PUR0618-194
Proposals opened July 11, 2018

Evaluators: Joy Huber, Fleet Manager; Brian Bowers, Fleet Equipment & Vehicle Coordinator; John Jackson, Garage Supervisor; Mitch Mensen, Garage Supervisor

Proposals received in alphabetical order):

Firm Name	Location	Total Score
Bauer Built Tire	Cedar Rapids, IA	967.50
Eastern Iowa Tire	Cedar Rapids, IA	835.00
GCR Tires & Service	Cedar Rapids, IA	737.50
Goodyear Tire	Cedar Rapids, IA	665.00

Proposal Summary:

1. Bauer Built Tire

Criteria	Points
Qualifications and Experience (50%)	500.00
Financial Proposal (40%)	360.00
Responsiveness (10%)	97.50
Local Preference Points	10.00
Total Evaluation Points	967.50

Facts:

- Qualified staff with extensive experience
- Cost is slightly higher but within competitive range
- Past experience with Fleet Services has been very good
- Provides value-added services at no additional cost to the City
- Retreads done in house in 1 week or sooner upon request

2. Eastern Iowa Tire

Criteria	Points
Qualifications and Experience (50%)	375.00
Financial Proposal (40%)	380.00
Responsiveness (10%)	70.00
Local Preference Points	10.00
Total Evaluation Points	835.00

Facts:

- Staff is qualified but does not have as much experience
- Cost is reasonable
- Retreads done in 1 day, sent to Davenport, IA
- Proposal did not provide clear value added benefits

3. GCR Tires & Service

Criteria	Points
Qualifications and Experience (50%)	275.00
Financial Proposal (40%)	400.00
Responsiveness (10%)	52.50
Local Preference Points	10.00
Total Evaluation Points	737.50

Facts:

- Staff is qualified but does not have as much experience
- Cost is reasonable
- Retreads done in 1 week, sent to Anita, IA
- Can not provide Goodyear Police Tires which has potential to increase cost to the City
- Walk-in service not given preference

4. Goodyear Tire

Criteria	Points
Qualifications and Experience (50%)	275.00
Financial Proposal (40%)	340.00
Responsiveness (10%)	40.00
Local Preference Points	10.00
Total Evaluation Points	665.00

Facts:

- Staff is qualified but does not have as much experience
- Cost is slightly higher
- Retreads done in 8 days, sent to Winona, MN
- Does not provide alignments
- No pricing for small utility tires

Recommendation for Award:

The evaluation team scored all four proposals and Bauer Built Tire was rated as the top proposal. A resolution will be presented to the City Council on August 14, 2018 recommending that the contract be awarded to Bauer Built Tire.